## **1995 SESSION**

**ENROLLED** 

[H 2333]

1

## VIRGINIA ACTS OF ASSEMBLY - CHAPTER

2 An Act to amend and reenact §§ 9-6.14:11 and 9-6.14:12 of the Code of Virginia, relating to decisions 3 by default.

4 5

## Approved

## 6 Be it enacted by the General Assembly of Virginia:

7 1. That §§ 9-6.14:11 and 9-6.14:12 of the Code of Virginia are amended and reenacted as follows: 8 § 9-6.14:11. Informal fact finding.

9 A. Agencies shall ascertain the fact basis for their decisions of cases through informal conference or 10 consultation proceedings unless the named party and the agency consent to waive such a conference or proceeding to go directly to a formal hearing. Such conference-consultation procedures include rights of 11 12 parties to the case (i) to have reasonable notice thereof, (ii) to appear in person or by counsel or other 13 qualified representative before the agency or its subordinates, or before a hearing officer as provided by subsection A of § 9-6.14:14.1, for the informal presentation of factual data, argument, or proof in 14 15 connection with any case, (iii) to have notice of any contrary fact basis or information in the possession 16 of the agency which can be relied upon in making an adverse decision, (iv) to receive a prompt decision 17 of any application for a license, benefit, or renewal thereof, and (v) to be informed, briefly and generally 18 in writing, of the factual or procedural basis for an adverse decision in any case.

19 B. Agencies may, in their case decisions, rely upon public data, documents or information only when 20 the agencies have provided all parties with advance notice of an intent to consider such public data, 21 documents or information. This requirement shall not apply to an agency's reliance on case law and 22 administrative precedent.

23 C. In cases where a board or commission meets to render an informal fact-finding decision and 24 information from a prior proceeding is being considered, persons who participated in the prior 25 proceeding shall be provided an opportunity to respond at the board or commission meeting to any 26 summaries of the prior proceeding prepared by or for the board or commission.

27 D. In any informal fact-finding proceeding in which a hearing officer, as described in § 9-6.14:14.1, 28 is not used or is not empowered to recommend a finding, the board, commission, or agency personnel 29 responsible for rendering a decision shall render that decision within ninety days from the date of the 30 informal fact-finding proceeding or from a later date agreed to by the named party and the agency. If 31 the agency does not render a decision within ninety days, the named party to the case decision may 32 provide written notice to the agency that a decision is due. If no decision is made within thirty days 33 from agency receipt of the notice, the decision is deemed to be in favor of the named party. The 34 preceding sentence shall not apply to case decisions before (i) the State Water Control Board or the 35 Department of Environmental Quality to the extent necessary to comply with the federal Clean Water Act or (ii) the State Air Pollution Control Board or the Department of Environmental Quality to the 36 extent necessary to comply with the federal Clean Air Act. An agency shall provide notification to the 37 38 named party of its decision within five days of the decision.

39 E. In any informal fact-finding proceeding in which a hearing officer, as described in § 9-6.14:14.1, 40 is empowered to recommend a finding, the board, commission, or agency personnel responsible for 41 rendering a decision shall render that decision within thirty days from the date that the agency receives 42 the hearing officer's recommendation. If the agency does not render a decision within thirty days, the 43 named party to the case decision may provide written notice to the agency that a decision is due. If no decision is made within thirty days from agency receipt of the notice, the decision is deemed to be in 44 45 favor of the named party. The preceding sentence shall not apply to case decisions before (i) the State Water Control Board or the Department of Environmental Quality to the extent necessary to comply 46 with the federal Clean Water Act or (ii) the State Air Pollution Control Board or the Department of 47 48 Environmental Quality to the extent necessary to comply with the federal Clean Air Act. An agency shall 49 provide notification to the named party of its decision within five days of the decision.

50 F. The provisions of subsection D notwithstanding, if the board members or agency personnel who conducted the informal proceeding are unable to attend to official duties due to sickness, disability, or 51 termination of their official capacity with the agency, then the timeframe provisions of subsection D 52 53 shall be reset and commence from the date that either new board members or agency personnel are 54 assigned to the matter or a new proceeding is conducted if needed, whichever is later. An agency shall 55 provide notification within five days to the named party of any incapacity of the board members or 56 agency personnel that necessitates a replacement or a new proceeding.

**57** § 9-6.14:12. Litigated issues.

A. The agency shall afford opportunity for the formal taking of evidence upon relevant fact issues in any case in which the basic laws provide expressly for decisions upon or after hearing and may do so in any case to the extent that informal procedures under § 9-6.14:11 have not been had or have failed to dispose of a case by consent.

B. Parties to such formal proceedings shall be given reasonable notice of (i) the time, place, and nature thereof, (ii) the basic law or laws under which the agency contemplates its possible exercise of authority, and (iii) the matters of fact and law asserted or questioned by the agency. Applicants for licenses, rights, benefits, or renewals thereof have the burden of approaching the agency concerned without such prior notice but they shall be similarly informed thereafter in the further course of the proceedings whether pursuant to this section or to § 9-6.14:11.

68 C. In all such formal proceedings the parties shall be entitled to be accompanied by and represented by counsel, to submit oral and documentary evidence and rebuttal proofs, to conduct such 69 cross-examination as may elicit a full and fair disclosure of the facts, and to have the proceedings completed and a decision made with dispatch. The burden of proof shall be upon the proponent or 70 71 72 applicant. The presiding officers at such proceedings are empowered to (i) administer oaths and 73 affirmations, (ii) receive probative evidence, exclude irrelevant, immaterial, insubstantial, privileged, or 74 repetitive proofs, rebuttal, or cross-examination, rule upon offers of proof, and oversee an accurate 75 verbatim recording of the evidence, (iii) hold conferences for the settlement or simplification of issues 76 by consent, (iv) dispose of procedural requests, and (v) regulate and expedite the course of the hearing. 77 Where a hearing officer presides, or where a subordinate designated for that purpose presides in hearings 78 specified in subsection F of § 9-6.14:14.1, he shall recommend findings and a decision unless the agency 79 shall by its procedural regulations provide for the making of findings and an initial decision by such 80 presiding officers subject to review and reconsideration by the agency on appeal to it as of right or on its own motion. The agency shall give deference to findings by the presiding officer explicitly based on 81 82 the demeanor of witnesses.

83 D. Prior to the recommendations or decisions of subordinates, the parties concerned shall be given 84 opportunity, on request, to submit in writing for the record (i) proposed findings and conclusions and (ii) statements of reasons therefor. In all cases, on request, opportunity shall be afforded for oral 85 argument (i) to hearing officers or subordinate presiding officers, as the case may be, in all cases in 86 87 which they make such recommendations or decisions or (ii) to the agency in cases in which it makes the 88 original decision without such prior recommendation and otherwise as it may permit in its discretion or 89 provide by general rule. Where hearing officers or subordinate presiding officers, as the case may be, 90 make recommendations or decisions, the agency shall receive and act on exceptions thereto.

E. All decisions or recommended decisions shall be served upon the parties, become a part of the record, and briefly state or recommend the findings, conclusions, reasons, or basis therefor upon the evidence presented by the record and relevant to the basic law under which the agency is operating together with the appropriate order, license, grant of benefits, sanction, relief, or denial thereof.

95 F. In cases where a board or commission meets to render a decision on a litigated issue and
96 information from a prior proceeding is being considered, persons who participated in the prior
97 proceeding shall be provided an opportunity to respond at the board or commission meeting to any
98 summaries of the prior proceeding prepared by or for the board or commission.

99 G. In any formal proceeding in which a hearing officer, as described in § 9-6.14:14.1, is not used or 100 is not empowered by the agency to recommend a finding, the board, commission, or agency personnel 101 responsible for rendering a decision shall render that decision within ninety days from the date of the 102 formal proceeding or from a later date agreed to by the named party and the agency. If the agency does not render a decision within ninety days, the named party to the case decision may provide written 103 104 notice to the agency that a decision is due. If no decision is made within thirty days from agency receipt 105 of the notice, then the decision is deemed to be in favor of the named party. The preceding sentence shall not apply to case decisions before (i) the State Water Control Board or the Department of 106 107 Environmental Quality to the extent necessary to comply with the federal Clean Water Act or (ii) the State Air Pollution Control Board or the Department of Environmental Quality to the extent necessary 108 109 to comply with the federal Clean Air Act. An agency shall provide notification to the named party of its 110 decision within five days of the decision.

H. In any formal proceeding in which a hearing officer, as described in § 9-6.14:14.1, is empowered to recommend a finding, the board, commission, or agency personnel responsible for rendering a decision shall render that decision within thirty days from the date that the agency receives the hearing officer's recommendation. If the agency does not render a decision within thirty days, the named party to the case decision may provide written notice to the agency that a decision is due. If no decision is made within thirty days from agency receipt of the notice, the decision is deemed to be in favor of the named party. *The preceding sentence shall not apply to case decisions before (i) the State Water Control Board*  118 or the Department of Environmental Quality to the extent necessary to comply with the federal Clean
119 Water Act or (ii) the State Air Pollution Control Board or the Department of Environmental Quality to
120 the extent necessary to comply with the federal Clean Air Act. An agency shall provide notification to
121 the named party of its decision within five days of the decision.

122 I. The provisions of subsection G notwithstanding, if the board members or agency personnel who 123 conducted the formal proceeding are unable to attend to official duties due to sickness, disability, or 124 termination of their official capacity with the agency, then the timeframe provisions of subsection G 125 shall be reset and commence from the date that either new board members or agency personnel are 126 assigned to the matter or a new proceeding is conducted if needed, whichever is later. An agency shall 127 provide notification within five days to the named party of any incapacity of the board members or

**128** agency personnel that necessitates a replacement or a new proceeding.