2020 SPECIAL SESSION I

ENROLLED

1

2

3

VIRGINIA ACTS OF ASSEMBLY - CHAPTER

An Act to amend and reenact §§ 9.1-507 and 15.2-1507 of the Code of Virginia and to amend the Code of Virginia by adding in Chapter 6 of Title 9.1 a section numbered 9.1-601, relating to [S 5035]

4 law-enforcement civilian oversight bodies.

5 6

7

20

Be it enacted by the General Assembly of Virginia:

1. That §§ 9.1-507 and 15.2-1507 of the Code of Virginia are amended and reenacted and that the 8 9 Code of Virginia is amended by adding in Chapter 6 of Title 9.1 a section numbered 9.1-601 as 10 follows: 11

Approved

§ 9.1-507. Chapter accords minimum rights; exception.

12 A. The rights accorded law-enforcement officers in this chapter are minimum rights and all agencies, 13 unless otherwise provided in this section, shall adopt grievance procedures that are consistent with this chapter. However, an agency may provide for additional rights of law-enforcement officers in its 14 15 grievance procedure.

16 B. The provisions of this chapter shall not apply to any law-enforcement officer or law-enforcement 17 agency that serves under the authority of a locality that has established a law-enforcement civilian oversight body pursuant to § 9.1-601. 18 19

§ 9.1-601. Law-enforcement civilian oversight bodies.

A. 1. As used in this section, unless the context requires a different meaning:

"Law-enforcement agency" means a police department established pursuant to § 15.2-1701 or a campus police department of any public institution of higher education of the Commonwealth employing 21 22 23 a law-enforcement officer established pursuant to § 23.1-809.

24 "Law-enforcement officer" means any person, other than a chief of police, who in his official 25 capacity (i) is authorized by law to make arrests and (ii) is a nonprobationary officer of a police 26 department, bureau, or force of any political subdivision, or a campus police department of any public 27 institution of higher education of the Commonwealth, where such department, bureau, or force has three 28 or more law-enforcement officers. "Law-enforcement officer" does not include a sheriff or deputy sheriff 29 or any law-enforcement officer who has rights afforded to him pursuant to the provisions of Chapter 5 30 (§ 9.1-500 et seq.). 31

"Locality" shall be construed to mean a county or city as the context may require.

32 2. For the purposes of this section, a "law-enforcement agency serving under the authority of the 33 locality" shall be construed to mean any law-enforcement agency established within the boundaries of a 34 locality, including any town police departments or any campus police departments of any public 35 institution of higher education of the Commonwealth established within such boundaries.

B. The governing body of a locality may establish a law-enforcement civilian oversight body. Any 36 37 law-enforcement civilian oversight body established by the governing body of a locality shall reflect the 38 demographic diversity of the locality.

39 C. A law-enforcement civilian oversight body established pursuant to this section may have the 40 following duties regarding any law-enforcement agency established within the boundaries of such 41 *locality:*

42 1. To receive, investigate, and issue findings on complaints from civilians regarding the conduct of 43 law-enforcement officers and civilian employees of a law-enforcement agency serving under the 44 authority of the locality;

2. To investigate and issue findings on incidents, including the use of force by a law-enforcement 45 46 officer, death or serious injury to any person held in custody, serious abuse of authority or misconduct, 47 allegedly discriminatory stops, and other incidents regarding the conduct of law-enforcement officers or **48** civilian employees of a law-enforcement agency serving under the authority of the locality;

49 3. Concordant with any investigation conducted pursuant to subdivisions 1 and 2 and after consultation with such officer's or employee's direct supervisor or commander, to make binding 50 disciplinary determinations in cases that involve serious breaches of departmental and professional 51 standards, as defined by the locality. Such disciplinary determinations may include letters of reprimand, 52 53 suspension without pay, suspension with pay, demotion within the department, reassignment within the 54 department, termination, involuntary restitution, or mediation, any of which to be implemented by the 55 local government employee with ultimate supervisory authority over officers or employees of 56 law-enforcement agencies serving under the authority of the locality;

SB5035ER

ENROLLED

57 4. To investigate policies, practices, and procedures of law-enforcement agencies serving under the 58 authority of the locality and to make recommendations regarding changes to such policies, practices, 59 and procedures. If the law-enforcement agency declines to implement any changes recommended by the 60 law-enforcement civilian oversight body, such law-enforcement civilian oversight body may require the 61 law-enforcement agency to create a written record, which shall be made available to the public, of its 62 rationale for declining to implement a recommendation of the law-enforcement civilian oversight body;

5. To review all investigations conducted internally by law-enforcement agencies serving under the 63 64 authority of the locality, including internal investigations of civilians employed by such law-enforcement 65 agencies, and to issue findings regarding the accuracy, completeness, and impartiality of such investigations and the sufficiency of any discipline resulting from such investigations; 66

67 6. To request reports of the annual expenditures of the law-enforcement agencies serving under the 68 authority of the locality and to make budgetary recommendations to the governing body of the locality 69 concerning future appropriations;

70 7. To make public reports on the activities of the law-enforcement civilian oversight body, including 71 investigations, hearings, findings, recommendations, determinations, and oversight activities; and

72 8. To undertake any other duties as reasonably necessary for the law-enforcement civilian oversight 73 body to effectuate its lawful purpose as provided for in this section to effectively oversee the 74 law-enforcement agencies serving under the authority of the locality.

75 D. The governing body of the locality shall establish the policies and procedures for the performance 76 of duties by the law-enforcement civilian oversight body as set forth in this section. The law-enforcement 77 civilian oversight body may hold hearings and, if after making a good faith effort to obtain, voluntarily, 78 the attendance of witnesses and the production of books, papers, and other evidence necessary to 79 perform its duties the law-enforcement civilian oversight body is unable to obtain such attendance or 80 production, it may apply to the circuit court for the locality for a subpoend compelling the attendance of such witness or the production of such books, papers, and other evidence, and the court may, upon 81 good cause shown, cause the subpoena to be issued. Any person so subpoenaed may apply to the court 82 83 that issued such subpoend to quash it.

84 E. Any person currently employed as a law-enforcement officer as defined in § 9.1-101 is ineligible 85 to serve on a law-enforcement civilian oversight body established pursuant to this section; however, a retired law-enforcement officer may serve on such law-enforcement civilian oversight body as an 86 advisory, nonvoting ex officio member. Such retired law-enforcement officer shall not have been 87 88 previously employed as a law-enforcement officer by a law-enforcement agency established within the 89 boundaries of such locality but shall have been employed as a law-enforcement officer as defined in 90 § 9.1-101 in a locality that is similar to the locality that established such law-enforcement civilian 91 oversight body.

92 F. A law-enforcement officer who is subject to a binding disciplinary determination may file a 93 grievance requesting a final hearing in accordance with § 15.2-1507, provided that such matter is a qualifying grievance under the locality's grievance procedures. 94

95 G. A law-enforcement civilian oversight body may retain legal counsel to represent such oversight 96 body in all cases, hearings, controversies, or matters involving the interests of the oversight body. Such 97 counsel shall be paid from funds appropriated by the locality. 98

§ 15.2-1507. Provision of grievance procedure; training programs.

99 A. If a local governing body fails to adopt a grievance procedure required by § 15.2-1506 or fails to certify it as provided in this section, the local governing body shall be deemed to have adopted a 100 grievance procedure that is consistent with the provisions of Chapter 30 (§ 2.2-3000 et seq.) of Title 2.2 101 102 and any regulations adopted pursuant thereto for so long as the locality remains in noncompliance. The 103 locality shall provide its employees with copies of the applicable grievance procedure upon request. The 104 term "grievance" as used herein shall not be interpreted to mean negotiations of wages, salaries, or 105 fringe benefits.

106 Each grievance procedure, and each amendment thereto, in order to comply with this section, shall be certified in writing to be in compliance by the city, town, or county attorney, and the chief 107 108 administrative officer of the locality, and such certification filed with the clerk of the circuit court having jurisdiction in the locality in which the procedure is to apply. Local government grievance 109 110 procedures in effect as of July 1, 1991, shall remain in full force and effect for 90 days thereafter, 111 unless certified and filed as provided above within a shorter time period. 112

Each grievance procedure shall include the following components and features:

113 1. Definition of grievance. A grievance shall be a complaint or dispute by an employee relating to 114 his employment, including (i) disciplinary actions, including dismissals, disciplinary demotions, and suspensions, provided that dismissals shall be grievable whenever resulting from formal discipline or 115 unsatisfactory job performance; (ii) the application of personnel policies, procedures, rules, and 116 regulations, including the application of policies involving matters referred to in clause (iii) of 117

SB5035ER

subdivision 2; (iii) discrimination on the basis of race, color, creed, religion, political affiliation, age, 118 119 disability, national origin, sex, marital status, pregnancy, childbirth or related medical conditions, sexual 120 orientation, gender identity, or status as a veteran; and (iv) acts of retaliation as the result of the use of 121 or participation in the grievance procedure or because the employee has complied with any law of the 122 United States or of the Commonwealth, has reported any violation of such law to a governmental 123 authority, has sought any change in law before the Congress of the United States or the General 124 Assembly, or has reported an incidence of fraud, abuse, or gross mismanagement. For the purposes of 125 clause (iv), there shall be a rebuttable presumption that increasing the penalty that is the subject of the 126 grievance at any level of the grievance shall be an act of retaliation.

127 2. Local government responsibilities. Local governments shall retain the exclusive right to manage 128 the affairs and operations of government. Accordingly, the following complaints are nongrievable: (i) 129 establishment and revision of wages or salaries, position classification, or general benefits; (ii) work 130 activity accepted by the employee as a condition of employment or work activity that may reasonably be 131 expected to be a part of the job content; (iii) the contents of ordinances, statutes, or established 132 personnel policies, procedures, rules, and regulations; (iv) failure to promote except where the employee 133 can show that established promotional policies or procedures were not followed or applied fairly; (v) the 134 methods, means, and personnel by which work activities are to be carried on; (vi) except where such 135 action affects an employee who has been reinstated within the previous six months as the result of the 136 final determination of a grievance, termination, layoff, demotion, or suspension from duties because of 137 lack of work, reduction in work force, or job abolition; (vii) the hiring, promotion, transfer, assignment, 138 and retention of employees within the local government; and (viii) the relief of employees from duties 139 of the local government in emergencies. In any grievance brought under the exception to clause (vi), the 140 action shall be upheld upon a showing by the local government that (a) there was a valid business 141 reason for the action and (b) the employee was notified of the reason in writing prior to the effective 142 date of the action.

3. Coverage of personnel.

143

a. Unless otherwise provided by law, all nonprobationary local government permanent full-time andpart-time employees are eligible to file grievances with the following exceptions:

146 (1) Appointees of elected groups or individuals;

147 (2) Officials and employees who by charter or other law serve at the will or pleasure of an appointing authority;

149 (3) Deputies and executive assistants to the chief administrative officer of a locality;

150 (4) Agency heads or chief executive officers of government operations;

(5) Employees whose terms of employment are limited by law;

(6) Temporary, limited term, and seasonal employees;

153 (7) Law-enforcement officers as defined in Chapter 5 (§ 9.1-500 et seq.) of Title 9.1 whose grievance
154 is subject to the provisions of Chapter 5 (§ 9.1-500 et seq.) of Title 9.1 and who have elected to proceed
155 pursuant to those provisions in the resolution of their grievance, or any other employee electing to
156 proceed pursuant to any other existing procedure in the resolution of his grievance; and

157 (8) Law-enforcement officers as defined in § 9.1-601 whose grievance is subject to the provisions of
158 § 9.1-601 and relates to a binding disciplinary determination made by a law-enforcement civilian
159 oversight body, except as permitted by subsection F of § 9.1-601.

b. Notwithstanding the exceptions set forth in subdivision a, local governments, at their sole
 discretion, may voluntarily include employees in any of the excepted categories within the coverage of
 their grievance procedures.

163 c. The chief administrative officer of each local government, or his designee, shall determine the
 164 officers and employees excluded from the grievance procedure, and shall be responsible for maintaining
 165 an up-to-date list of the affected positions.

166 4. Grievance procedure availability and coverage for employees of community services boards, 167 redevelopment and housing authorities, and regional housing authorities. Employees of community 168 services boards, redevelopment and housing authorities created pursuant to § 36-4, and regional housing 169 authorities created pursuant to § 36-40 shall be included in (i) a local governing body's grievance 170 procedure or personnel system, if agreed to by the department, board, or authority and the locality or (ii) 171 a grievance procedure established and administered by the department, board, or authority that is 172 consistent with the provisions of Chapter 30 (§ 2.2-3000 et seq.) of Title 2.2 and any regulations 173 promulgated pursuant thereto. If a department, board, or authority fails to establish a grievance 174 procedure pursuant to clause (i) or (ii), it shall be deemed to have adopted a grievance procedure that is 175 consistent with the provisions of Chapter 30 (§ 2.2-3000 et seq.) of Title 2.2 and any regulations 176 adopted pursuant thereto for so long as it remains in noncompliance.

177 5. General requirements for procedures.

178 a. Each grievance procedure shall include not more than four steps for airing complaints at

179 successively higher levels of local government management, and a final step providing for a panel 180 hearing or a hearing before an administrative hearing officer upon the agreement of both parties.

181 b. Grievance procedures shall prescribe reasonable and specific time limitations for the grievant to 182 submit an initial complaint and to appeal each decision through the steps of the grievance procedure.

183 c. Nothing contained in this section shall prohibit a local government from granting its employees 184 rights greater than those contained herein, provided that such grant does not exceed or violate the 185 general law or public policy of the Commonwealth.

186 6. Time periods.

a. It is intended that speedy attention to employee grievances be promoted, consistent with the ability 187 188 of the parties to prepare for a fair consideration of the issues of concern.

189 b. The time for submitting an initial complaint shall not be less than 20 calendar days after the event 190 giving rise to the grievance, but local governments may, at their option, allow a longer time period.

191 c. Limits for steps after initial presentation of grievance shall be the same or greater for the grievant 192 than the time that is allowed for local government response in each comparable situation.

d. Time frames may be extended by mutual agreement of the local government and the grievant.

7. Compliance.

193

194

218

195 a. After the initial filing of a written grievance, failure of either party to comply with all substantial 196 procedural requirements of the grievance procedure, including the panel or administrative hearing, 197 without just cause shall result in a decision in favor of the other party on any grievable issue, provided 198 the party not in compliance fails to correct the noncompliance within five workdays of receipt of written 199 notification by the other party of the compliance violation. Such written notification by the grievant shall 200 be made to the chief administrative officer, or his designee.

201 b. The chief administrative officer, or his designee, at his option, may require a clear written 202 explanation of the basis for just cause extensions or exceptions. The chief administrative officer, or his designee, shall determine compliance issues. Compliance determinations made by the chief 203 204 administrative officer shall be subject to judicial review by filing petition with the circuit court within 205 30 days of the compliance determination. 206

8. Management steps.

207 a. The first step shall provide for an informal, initial processing of employee complaints by the 208 immediate supervisor through a nonwritten, discussion format.

209 b. Management steps shall provide for a review with higher levels of local government authority 210 following the employee's reduction to writing of the grievance and the relief requested on forms 211 supplied by the local government. Personal face-to-face meetings are required at all of these steps.

212 c. With the exception of the final management step, the only persons who may normally be present 213 in the management step meetings are the grievant, the appropriate local government official at the level 214 at which the grievance is being heard, and appropriate witnesses for each side. Witnesses shall be present only while actually providing testimony. At the final management step, the grievant, at his 215 216 option, may have present a representative of his choice. If the grievant is represented by legal counsel, 217 local government likewise has the option of being represented by counsel.

9. Qualification for panel or administrative hearing.

a. Decisions regarding grievability and access to the procedure shall be made by the chief 219 220 administrative officer of the local government, or his designee, at any time prior to the panel hearing, at the request of the local government or grievant, within 10 calendar days of the request. No city, town, 221 222 or county attorney, or attorney for the Commonwealth, shall be authorized to decide the question of 223 grievability. A copy of the ruling shall be sent to the grievant. Decisions of the chief administrative 224 officer of the local government, or his designee, may be appealed to the circuit court having jurisdiction 225 in the locality in which the grievant is employed for a hearing on the issue of whether the grievance 226 qualifies for a panel hearing. Proceedings for review of the decision of the chief administrative officer or 227 his designee shall be instituted by the grievant by filing a notice of appeal with the chief administrative 228 officer within 10 calendar days from the date of receipt of the decision and giving a copy thereof to all 229 other parties. Within 10 calendar days thereafter, the chief administrative officer or his designee shall 230 transmit to the clerk of the court to which the appeal is taken: a copy of the decision of the chief administrative officer, a copy of the notice of appeal, and the exhibits. A list of the evidence furnished 231 232 to the court shall also be furnished to the grievant. The failure of the chief administrative officer or his designee to transmit the record shall not prejudice the rights of the grievant. The court, on motion of the 233 234 grievant, may issue a writ of certiorari requiring the chief administrative officer to transmit the record on 235 or before a certain date.

236 b. Within 30 days of receipt of such records by the clerk, the court, sitting without a jury, shall hear 237 the appeal on the record transmitted by the chief administrative officer or his designee and such 238 additional evidence as may be necessary to resolve any controversy as to the correctness of the record. 239 The court, in its discretion, may receive such other evidence as the ends of justice require. The court

SB5035ER

may affirm the decision of the chief administrative officer or his designee, or may reverse or modify thedecision. The decision of the court shall be rendered no later than the fifteenth day from the date of theconclusion of the hearing. The decision of the court is final and is not appealable.

243 10. Final hearings.

a. Qualifying grievances shall advance to either a panel hearing or a hearing before an administrativehearing officer, as set forth in the locality's grievance procedure, as described below:

246 (1) If the grievance procedure adopted by the local governing body provides that the final step shall 247 be an impartial panel hearing, the panel may, with the exception of those local governments covered by 248 subdivision a (2), consist of one member appointed by the grievant, one member appointed by the 249 agency head and a third member selected by the first two. In the event that agreement cannot be reached 250 as to the final panel member, the chief judge of the circuit court of the jurisdiction wherein the dispute 251 arose shall select the third panel member. The panel shall not be composed of any persons having direct 252 involvement with the grievance being heard by the panel, or with the complaint or dispute giving rise to 253 the grievance. Managers who are in a direct line of supervision of a grievant, persons residing in the 254 same household as the grievant and the following relatives of a participant in the grievance process or a 255 participant's spouse are prohibited from serving as panel members: spouse, parent, child, descendants of 256 a child, sibling, niece, nephew and first cousin. No attorney having direct involvement with the subject 257 matter of the grievance, nor a partner, associate, employee or co-employee of the attorney shall serve as 258 a panel member.

(2) If the grievance procedure adopted by the local governing body provides for the final step to be an impartial panel hearing, local governments may retain the panel composition method previously approved by the Department of Human Resource Management and in effect as of the enactment of this statute. Modifications to the panel composition method shall be permitted with regard to the size of the panel and the terms of office for panel members, so long as the basic integrity and independence of panels are maintained. As used in this section, the term "panel" shall include all bodies designated and authorized to make final and binding decisions.

266 (3) When a local government elects to use an administrative hearing officer rather than a three-person panel for the final step in the grievance procedure, the administrative hearing officer shall 267 268 be appointed by the Executive Secretary of the Supreme Court of Virginia. The appointment shall be 269 made from the list of administrative hearing officers maintained by the Executive Secretary pursuant to 270 § 2.2-4024 and shall be made from the appropriate geographical region on a rotating basis. In the alternative, the local government may request the appointment of an administrative hearing officer from 271 272 the Department of Human Resource Management. If a local government elects to use an administrative 273 hearing officer, it shall bear the expense of such officer's services.

(4) When the local government uses a panel in the final step of the procedure, there shall be a
chairperson of the panel and, when panels are composed of three persons (one each selected by the
respective parties and the third from an impartial source), the third member shall be the chairperson.

(5) Both the grievant and the respondent may call upon appropriate witnesses and be represented by
legal counsel or other representatives at the hearing. Such representatives may examine, cross-examine,
question and present evidence on behalf of the grievant or respondent before the panel or hearing officer
without being in violation of the provisions of § 54.1-3904.

(6) The decision of the panel or hearing officer shall be final and binding and shall be consistentwith provisions of law and written policy.

(7) The question of whether the relief granted by a panel or hearing officer is consistent with written
policy shall be determined by the chief administrative officer of the local government, or his designee,
unless such person has a direct personal involvement with the event or events giving rise to the
grievance, in which case the decision shall be made by the attorney for the Commonwealth of the
jurisdiction in which the grievance is pending.

288 b. Rules for panel and administrative hearings.

289 Unless otherwise provided by law, local governments shall adopt rules for the conduct of panel or
290 administrative hearings as a part of their grievance procedures, or shall adopt separate rules for such hearings. Rules that are promulgated shall include the following provisions:

(1) That neither the panels nor the hearing officer have authority to formulate policies or proceduresor to alter existing policies or procedures;

(2) That panels and the hearing officer have the discretion to determine the propriety of attendance atthe hearing of persons not having a direct interest in the hearing, and, at the request of either party, thehearing shall be private;

(3) That the local government provide the panel or hearing officer with copies of the grievance
record prior to the hearing, and provide the grievant with a list of the documents furnished to the panel
or hearing officer, and the grievant and his attorney, at least 10 days prior to the scheduled hearing,
shall be allowed access to and copies of all relevant files intended to be used in the grievance

301 proceeding;

(4) That panels and hearing officers have the authority to determine the admissibility of evidence 302 without regard to the burden of proof, or the order of presentation of evidence, so long as a full and 303 304 equal opportunity is afforded to all parties for the presentation of their evidence;

305 (5) That all evidence be presented in the presence of the panel or hearing officer and the parties, except by mutual consent of the parties; 306

(6) That documents, exhibits and lists of witnesses be exchanged between the parties or hearing 307 308 officer in advance of the hearing;

309 (7) That the majority decision of the panel or the decision of the hearing officer, acting within the scope of its or his authority, be final, subject to existing policies, procedures and law; 310 311

(8) That the panel or hearing officer's decision be provided within a specified time to all parties; and

312 (9) Such other provisions as may facilitate fair and expeditious hearings, with the understanding that 313 the hearings are not intended to be conducted like proceedings in courts, and that rules of evidence do 314 not necessarily apply. 315

11. Implementation of final hearing decisions.

Either party may petition the circuit court having jurisdiction in the locality in which the grievant is 316 317 employed for an order requiring implementation of the hearing decision.

318 B. Notwithstanding the contrary provisions of this section, a final hearing decision rendered under 319 the provisions of this section that would result in the reinstatement of any employee of a sheriff's office, who has been terminated for cause may be reviewed by the circuit court for the locality upon the 320 321 petition of the locality. The review of the circuit court shall be limited to the question of whether the 322 decision of the panel or hearing officer was consistent with provisions of law and written policy.

323 2. That the provisions of this act shall become effective on July 1, 2021.