DEPARTMENT OF TAXATION
2017 Fiscal Impact Statement

1. Patron A. Benton Chafin, Jr.

2. Bill Number SB 1470
House of Origin:
_____ **Introduced**
_____ **Substitute**
_____ **Engrossed**

Second House:
__X__ **In Committee**
_____ **Substitute**
_____ **Enrolled**

3. Committee House Finance

4. Title Income Tax; Virginia Coal Tax Credits

5. Summary/Purpose:

This bill would limit the aggregate amount of Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits that may be allocated or claimed by electricity generators to $7.3 million per fiscal year.

This bill would allow taxpayers with an economic interest in coal to redeem Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits allocated by an electricity generator that were earned on or after January 1, 2017. Credits received pursuant to an allocation on or after January 1, 2017 would be redeemable for credits earned before July 1, 2022.

Finally, this bill would extend the sunset date for the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit from taxable years beginning before January 1, 2017 to taxable years beginning before January 1, 2022.

This effective date of this bill is not specified.

6. Budget amendment necessary: Yes.
Page 1, Revenue Estimates

7. Fiscal Impact Estimates are: Preliminary. (See Line 8.)
7b. Revenue Impact:

Fiscal Year	*Dollars*	*Fund*
2016-17	$0	GF
2016-17	$0	NGF
2017-18	$400,000	GF
2017-18	$200,000	NGF
2018-19	$500,000	GF
2018-19	$200,000	NGF
2019-20	$600,000	GF
2019-20	$200,000	NGF
2020-21	($17.3 million)	GF
2020-21	$2.7 million	NGF
2021-22	($16.1 million)	GF
2021-22	$2.5 million	NGF
2022-23	($15.0 million)	GF
2022-23	$2.4 million	NGF

8. Fiscal implications:

Administrative Costs

The Department of Taxation ("the Department") considers implementation of this bill as routine, and does not require additional funding.

Revenue Impact

General Fund Revenue Impact

This bill would have a positive General Fund revenue impact of $400,000 in Fiscal Year 2018, $500,000 in Fiscal Year 2019, and $600,000 in Fiscal Year 2020. This bill would have a negative General Fund revenue impact of $17.3 million in Fiscal Year 2021, $16.1 million in Fiscal Year 2022, and $15 million in Fiscal Year 2023.

During Fiscal Years 2014, 2015, and 2016, taxpayers claimed an average of $9.3 million in Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits. Limiting the amount of such credits that may be claimed to $7.3 million annually would have a positive General Fund revenue impact of $2 million per year, beginning in Fiscal Year 2018. This provision would also limit the risk to the General Fund of a large amount of credits being claimed during a particular year. During Fiscal Year 2013, taxpayers claimed $59.4 million Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits. This significant increase in the amount of credits claimed was caused by taxpayers claiming a large number of carryover credits in Fiscal Year 2013, and was unexpected after no credits were claimed during the prior two fiscal years. Capping the annual amount of newly issued and carryover credits claimed at $7.3 million would limit the General Fund's exposure to this risk in the future by significantly limiting the degree to which the amount claimed could fluctuate annually.

However, the positive General Fund revenue impact would be partially offset by permitting persons with an economic interest in coal to redeem Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits earned on or after January 1, 2017 to the extent the credits exceed such person's tax liability. Such provision would have a negative General Fund revenue impact of $1.6 million in Fiscal Year 2018, $1.5 million in Fiscal Year 2019, $1.4 million in Fiscal Year 2020, $1.3 million in Fiscal Year 2021, $1.2 million in Fiscal Year 2022, and $1.2 million in Fiscal Year 2023.

In addition, the extension of the sunset date for the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit would have a negative revenue impact beginning in Fiscal Year 2021. Because the credit may not be claimed until the third taxable year after the credit was earned, the revenue impact of extending the credit would not be realized until income tax returns are filed for Taxable Year 2020, which generally occurs during Fiscal Year 2021. As a result, this provision would result in a negative General Fund revenue impact of $18 million in Fiscal Year 2021, $16.9 million in Fiscal Year 2022, and $15.8 million in Fiscal Year 2023.

Impact on the Coalfields Economic Development Authority

The Coalfields Economic Development Authority Fund ("the Fund") receives 15 percent of the face value of coal tax credits redeemed by taxpayers. Accordingly, the redemption of Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits by persons with an economic interest in coal for credits earned on and after January 1, 2017 would have a positive impact on the Fund, beginning in Fiscal Year 2018. Similarly, the extension of the sunset date of the sunset date of the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit would have a positive impact on the Fund, beginning in Fiscal Year 2021. The overall positive impact to the Fund would be $200,000 annually in Fiscal Years 2018 through 2020, $2.7 million in Fiscal Year 2021, $2.5 million in Fiscal Year 2022, and $2.4 million in Fiscal Year 2023.

9. Specific agency or political subdivisions affected:

Department of Taxation

10. Technical amendment necessary: No.

11. Other comments:

Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credit

The Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credit is a credit allowed to electricity generators in Virginia against the corporation income tax and the tax that applies to electric suppliers, pipeline distribution companies, gas utilities, and gas suppliers. The amount of the credit is equal to $3 for each ton of coal purchased and consumed by an electricity generator, provided such coal was mined in Virginia. To the extent an electricity generator purchased coal qualifying for the credit from a person with an economic interest in coal, the credit may be allocated between the electricity generator and such person with an economic interest in coal. Any person with an economic interest in coal that received an allocation of credits is permitted to redeem such credits only if they were earned in a taxable year ending before July 1, 2016.

Any credit not allocated to a person with an economic interest in coal that is not usable for the taxable year for which the credit was issued may be carried over for up to ten taxable years. To the extent credit allocated to a person with an economic interest in coal exceeds such person's Virginia tax liability, such taxpayer is entitled to redeem the excess credits in an amount equal to 85 percent of the face value of such excess. The remaining 15 percent is to be deposited in a regional economic development fund administered by the Coalfield Economics Development Authority.

Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit

Persons with an economic interest in coal mined in Virginia were permitted to claim the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit against any tax imposed by Virginia. For coal mined underground, the credit amount varied according to the seam thickness of the coal that is being mined. The credit was equal to $2.00 per ton for a seam thickness of 36 inches or less and $1.00 per ton for a seam thickness greater than 36 inches. For coal mined by surface mining methods, the credit was equal to $0.40 per ton of coal sold. Coalbed methane gas producers may claim a credit equal to $0.01 per million BTU's of gas produced.

The credit could be claimed in the third taxable year following the taxable year in which the credit was earned and allowed. To the extent the credit exceeded a taxpayer's Virginia tax liability, the taxpayer was entitled to redeem the excess credits in an amount equal to 85 percent of the face value of such excess. The remaining 15 percent was required to be deposited in a regional economic development fund administered by the Coalfield Economics Development Authority.

The Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit expired for taxable years beginning on or after January 1, 2017.

JLARC Report on the Coal-Related Tax Credits

During 2011, the Joint Legislative Audit and Review Commission ("JLARC") reviewed the effectiveness of Virginia's tax preferences. According to JLARC's report, the coal credits do not appear to be effectively promoting coal production and employment in Virginia. JLARC found that Virginia coal production and employment have declined by over 50 percent since their historic highs in 1990. Both of the coal credits were enacted to slow the decline of Virginia coal employment and production, which were each predicted to decline by 28 percent between 1996 and 2005 without the credits. Despite the enactment of the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit in 1995 and the Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credit in 1999, between 1996 and 2005, Virginia's coal production declined by 27 percent and coal employment declined by 36 percent. JLARC concluded that although the coal credits can significantly reduce tax liability for mine operators, they do not appear to be sufficient to counteract the negative impact of other factors on Virginia coal production and employment, such as the high costs of production and transportation.

Despite their potential ineffectiveness, as of January 2017, taxpayers have claimed $26.5 million in coal-related tax credits for Fiscal Year 2016. In addition to the large fiscal impact, these credits tend to be volatile, which can cause potential unexpected revenue shortfalls. For example, in Fiscal Year 2013, electricity generators claimed $59 million worth of Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits after not claiming any of this credit for several years prior. This large revenue loss was due to built-up credit carryovers that were claimed in the same year by several generators that began generating profits, and as a result, finally had sufficient tax liability to absorb the credits.

Proposed Legislation

This bill would limit the aggregate amount of Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits that may be allocated or claimed by electricity generators to $7.3 million per fiscal year. No electricity generator would be permitted to allocate or claim any tax credit during the relevant fiscal year until it has filed an application with the Department. The Department would then be required to determine and approve the amount of tax credits that each electricity generator may allocate or claim during the fiscal year. If applications for the relevant fiscal year exceed $7.3 million, the Department would apportion the tax credits first based on tax credits that were earned during the current taxable year by electricity generators. If such tax credits earned during the current taxable year exceed $7.3 million, the credits would be apportioned pro rata. If there is a remaining balance of tax credits after credits have been apportioned for tax credits earned during the current taxable year, such remaining balance would be apportioned pro rata based on tax credits earned in prior taxable years that are being carried forward by electricity generators.

This bill would allow taxpayers with an economic interest in coal to redeem Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits allocated by an electricity generator that were earned on or after January 1, 2017. Credits received pursuant to an allocation on or after January 1, 2017 would be redeemable for credits earned before July 1, 2022. Under current law, taxpayers with an economic interest in coal are permitted to redeem credits allocated by an electricity generator if they were earned before July 1, 2016.

This bill would extend the sunset date for the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit from taxable years beginning before January 1, 2017 to taxable years beginning before January 1, 2022.

This bill would require the Department to develop and make publicly available guidelines, exempt from the provisions of the Administrative Process Act, implementing the provisions of this bill.

The effective date of this bill is not specified.

Similar Bills

House Bill 2198 is identical to this bill.

cc : Secretary of Finance

Date: 2/9/2017 MTH
SB1470FE161