DEPARTMENT OF TAXATION
2016 Fiscal Impact Statement

1. Patron Charles W. Carrico, Sr.

2. Bill Number SB 44

House of Origin:

_____ **Introduced**
_____ **Substitute**
_____ **Engrossed**

Second House:

_____ **In Committee**
_____ **Substitute**
__X__ **Enrolled**

3. Committee Passed House and Senate

4. Title Income Tax; Virginia Coal Tax Credits

5. Summary/Purpose:

This bill would limit the aggregate amount of Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits that may be allocated or claimed by electricity generators to $7.3 million per fiscal year.

This bill would also extend the time period during which persons with an economic interest in coal may redeem Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits allocated by an electricity generator, so that such redemption would expire for credits earned on or after January 1, 2022, rather than July 1, 2016.

Finally, this bill would extend the sunset date for the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit from taxable years beginning before January 1, 2017 to taxable years beginning before January 1, 2022.

This effective date of this bill is not specified.

6. Budget amendment necessary: Yes.
Page 1, Revenue Estimates

7. Fiscal Impact Estimates are: Preliminary. (See Line 8.)
7b. Revenue Impact:

Fiscal Year	***Dollars***	***Fund***
2015-16	$0	GF
2016-17	$1.1 million	GF
2016-17	$100,000	NGF
2017-18	$400,000	GF
2017-18	$200,000	NGF
2018-19	$500,000	GF
2018-19	$200,000	NGF
2019-20	$600,000	GF
2019-20	$200,000	NGF
2020-21	($17.3 million)	GF

2020-21	$2.7 million	NGF
2021-22	($16.1 million)	GF
2021-22	$2.5 million	NGF

8. Fiscal implications:

Administrative Costs

The Department of Taxation ("the Department") considers implementation of this bill as routine, and does not require additional funding.

Revenue Impact

General Fund Revenue Impact

This bill would have a positive General Fund revenue impact of $1.1 million in Fiscal Year 2017, $400,000 in Fiscal Year 2018, $500,000 in Fiscal Year 2019, and $600,000 in Fiscal Year 2020, followed by a negative General Fund revenue impact of $17.3 million in Fiscal Year 2021 and $16.1 million in Fiscal Year 2022.

During Fiscal Years 2014 and 2015, taxpayers claimed an average of $9.3 million in Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits. Limiting the amount of such credits that may be claimed to $7.3 million annually would have a positive General Fund revenue impact of $2 million per year, beginning in Fiscal Year 2017. This provision would also limit the risk to the General Fund of a large amount of credits being claimed during a particular year. During Fiscal Year 2013, taxpayers claimed $59.4 million Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits. This significant increase in the amount of credits claimed was caused by taxpayers claiming a large number of carryover credits in Fiscal Year 2013, and was unexpected after no credits were claimed during the prior two fiscal years. Capping the annual amount of newly issued and carryover credits claimed at $7.3 million would limit the General Fund's exposure to this risk in the future by significantly limiting the degree to which the amount claimed could fluctuate annually.

However, the positive General Fund revenue impact would be partially offset by the extension of the provision that permits persons with an economic interest in coal to redeem Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits that exceed such person's tax liability. Because the July 1, 2016 expiration of this provision is assumed in the Introduced Executive Budget, extending such sunset date would have a negative General Fund revenue impact of $900,000 in Fiscal Year 2017, $1.6 million in Fiscal Year 2018, $1.5 million in Fiscal Year 2019, $1.4 million in Fiscal Year 2020, $1.3 million in Fiscal Year 2021, and $1.2 million in Fiscal Year 2022.

In addition, the extension of the sunset date for the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit would have a negative revenue impact beginning in Fiscal Year 2021. The expiration of this credit is assumed in the Introduced Executive Budget. Because the credit may not be claimed until the third taxable year after the credit was earned, the revenue impact of extending the credit would not be realized until income tax returns are filed for Taxable Year 2020, which generally occurs during Fiscal Year 2021. As a result, this provision would result in a negative General Fund revenue impact of $18 million in Fiscal Year 2021 and $16.9 million in Fiscal Year 2022.

Impact on the Coalfields Economic Development Authority

The Coalfields Economic Development Authority Fund ("the Fund") receives 15 percent of the face value of coal tax credits redeemed by taxpayers. Accordingly, extending the July 1, 2016 sunset date for the redemption of Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits by persons with an economic interest in coal would have a positive impact on the Fund, beginning in Fiscal Year 2017. Similarly, the extension of the sunset date of the sunset date of the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit would have a positive impact on the Fund, beginning in Fiscal Year 2021. The overall positive impact to the Fund would be $100,000 in Fiscal Year 2017, $200,000 annually in Fiscal Years 2018 through 2020, $2.7 million in Fiscal Year 2021, and $2.5 million in Fiscal Year 2022.

9. Specific agency or political subdivisions affected:

Department of Taxation

10. Technical amendment necessary: No.

11. Other comments:

Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credit

The Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credit is a credit allowed to electricity generators in Virginia against the corporation income tax and the tax that applies to electric suppliers, pipeline distribution companies, gas utilities, and gas suppliers. The amount of the credit is equal to $3 for each ton of coal purchased and consumed by an electricity generator, provided such coal was mined in Virginia. To the extent an electricity generator purchased coal qualifying for the credit from a person with an economic interest in coal, the credit may be allocated between the electricity generator and such person with an economic interest in coal. Any person with an economic interest in coal that receives an allocation of credits is required to redeem such credits in a taxable year ending before July 1, 2016.

Any credit not allocated to a person with an economic interest in coal that is not usable for the taxable year for which the credit was issued may be carried over for up to ten taxable years. To the extent credit allocated to a person with an economic interest in coal exceeds such person's Virginia tax liability, such taxpayer is entitled to redeem the excess credits in an amount equal to 85 percent of the face value of such excess. The remaining 15 percent is to be deposited in a regional economic development fund administered by the Coalfield Economics Development Authority.

Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit

Persons with an economic interest in coal mined in Virginia are permitted to claim the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit against any tax imposed by Virginia. For coal mined underground, the credit amount varies according to the seam thickness of the coal that is being mined. The credit is equal to $2.00 per ton for a seam thickness of 36 inches or less and $1.00 per ton for a seam thickness greater than 36 inches. For coal mined by surface mining methods, the credit is equal to $0.40 per ton of coal sold. Coalbed methane gas producers may claim a credit equal to $0.01 per million BTU's of gas produced.

The credit may be claimed in the third taxable year following the taxable year in which the credit was earned and allowed. To the extent the credit exceeds a taxpayer's Virginia tax liability, the taxpayer is entitled to redeem the excess credits in an amount equal to 85 percent of the face value of such excess. The remaining 15 percent is to be deposited in a regional economic development fund administered by the Coalfield Economics Development Authority.

The Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit is currently available for taxable years beginning before January 1, 2017.

JLARC Report on the Coal-Related Tax Credits

During 2011, the Joint Legislative Audit and Review Commission ("JLARC") reviewed the effectiveness of Virginia's tax preferences. According to JLARC's report, the coal credits do not appear to be effectively promoting coal production and employment in Virginia. JLARC found that Virginia coal production and employment have declined by over 50 percent since their historic highs in 1990. Both of the coal credits were enacted to slow the decline of Virginia coal employment and production, which were each predicted to decline by 28 percent between 1996 and 2005 without the credits. Despite the enactment of the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit in 1995 and the Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credit in 1999, between 1996 and 2005, Virginia's coal production declined by 27 percent and coal employment declined by 36 percent. JLARC concluded that although the coal credits can significantly reduce tax liability for mine operators, they do not appear to be sufficient to counteract the negative impact of other factors on Virginia coal production and employment, such as the high costs of production and transportation.

Despite their potential ineffectiveness, taxpayers claimed over $37 million in coal-related tax credits during Fiscal Year 2015. In addition to the large fiscal impact, these credits tend to be volatile, which can cause potential unexpected revenue shortfalls. For example, in Fiscal Year 2013, electricity generators claimed $59 million worth of Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits after not claiming any of this credit for several years prior. This large revenue loss was due to built-up credit carryovers that were claimed in the same year by several generators that began generating profits, and as a result, finally had sufficient tax liability to absorb the credits.

Proposed Legislation

This bill would limit the aggregate amount of Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits that may be allocated or claimed by electricity generators to $7.3 million per fiscal year. No electricity generator would be permitted to allocate or claim any tax credit during the relevant fiscal year until it has filed an application with the Department. The Department would then be required to determine and approve the amount of tax credits that each electricity generator may allocate or claim during the fiscal year. If applications for the relevant fiscal year exceed $7.3 million, the Department would apportion the tax credits first based on tax credits that were earned during the current taxable year by electricity generators. If such tax credits earned during the current taxable year exceed $7.3 million, the credits would be apportioned pro rata. If there is a remaining balance of tax credits after credits have been apportioned for tax credits earned during the current taxable year, such remaining balance would be apportioned pro rata based on tax credits earned in prior taxable years that are being carried forward by electricity generators.

This bill would extend the time period during which persons with an economic interest in coal may redeem Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits allocated by an electricity generator, so that such redemption would expire for credits earned on or after January 1, 2022, rather than July 1, 2016.

This bill would extend the sunset date for the Coalfield Employment Enhancement Tax Credit from taxable years beginning before January 1, 2017 to taxable years beginning before January 1, 2022.

The effective date of this bill is not specified.

Similar Bills

Senate Bill 44 is substantially similar to this bill, except that it would impose a sunset date of January 1, 2020, and would limit the amount of Virginia Coal Employment and Production Incentive Tax Credits to $7.5 million per fiscal year, rather than $7.3 million.

cc : Secretary of Finance

Date: 2/29/2016 MTH
SB44FER161