

Department of Planning and Budget

2019 Fiscal Impact Statement

1. Bill Number: SB 1641

House of Origin ☒ Introduced ☐ Substitute ☐ Engrossed
 Second House ☐ In Committee ☐ Substitute ☐ Enrolled

2. Patron: Boysko

3. Committee: Transportation

4. Title: Driver privilege cards; penalty.

5. Summary: This bill authorizes the issuance of new driver privilege cards by the Department of Motor Vehicles to an applicant who (i) has reported income from Virginia sources on an individual tax return filed with the Commonwealth in the preceding 12 months and (ii) is not in violation of the insurance requirements for the registration of an uninsured motor vehicle. The bill provides that driver privilege cards shall confer the same privileges and shall be subject to the same provisions as driver's licenses and permits; however, driver privilege cards shall not (a) confer voting privileges, (b) permit an individual to waive any part of the driver examination, or (c) have their issuance be contingent upon the applicant's ability to produce proof of legal presence in the United States. The bill has a delayed effective date of January 1, 2020.

6. Budget Amendment Necessary: Yes, Item 442 and Item 390.

7. Fiscal Impact Estimates: Preliminary. See Item #8.

7a. Expenditure Impact:

<i>Fiscal Year</i>	<i>Dollars</i>	<i>Positions</i>	<i>Fund</i>
2019	-	-	-
2020	\$5,905,531	84	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2020	\$50,000	-	General Fund
2021	\$4,281,918	69	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2022	\$3,935,990	59	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2023	\$3,612,261	55	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2024	\$2,488,164	35	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2025	\$2,162,720	31	Motor Vehicle Special Fund

7b. Revenue Impact:

<i>Fiscal Year</i>	<i>Dollars</i>	<i>Fund</i>
2019	-	-
2020	\$8,468,307	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2021	\$6,112,904	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2022	\$8,677,470	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2023	\$7,690,915	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2024	\$6,420,014	Motor Vehicle Special Fund
2025	\$5,409,524	Motor Vehicle Special Fund

- 8. Fiscal Implications:** During the 2016 Session of the Virginia General Assembly, five bills involved the provision of driving credentials to resident immigrants. As a result, the Chairman of the House Transportation Committee directed the Department of Motor Vehicles (DMV) to study the impact of potentially issuing credentials to immigrant residents, including undocumented individuals.

Initial assumptions were that the Commonwealth should not be negatively financially impacted by creating Driver Privilege Cards (DPCs) and the cost of an original DPC should cover costs incurred in the first year of implementation. Initial costs are comprised of DMV staffing at customer service centers, training, DMV law enforcement, system programming including the costs for DMV's card vendor to design a new DPC credential, and an electronic verification process with the Virginia Department of Taxation (TAX). DMV will work with TAX to implement and fund the verification system. As was identified in 7a, DMV will need an additional 84 full-time employees in the first year of implementation with staffing needs decreasing in later years as the customers move into the renewal cycle. A budget amendment is necessary to increase DMV's maximum employment level (MEL) in order for DMV to be able to hire the appropriate staff. Without these staff, DMV will experience increased wait times following implementation of SB 1641.

The current estimate of undocumented individuals eligible to drive is 266,808 based on Pew Research Center released in November 2018 (based on 2016 population information). This estimate is down from previous estimates that were based on 2014 Pew Research Center data. Based upon the experiences of other states concerning the percentage of their estimated undocumented populations applied for DPCs in the first few years of implementation, the following is assumed:

Estimate of number of undocumented immigrants who would apply for DPC each year (based on an estimated 266,808 total eligible immigrants and participation rates in comparable states)				
Year	Original DPCs		Renewal DPCs	
1	35 percent	93,383 applicants	0 percent	0 applicants
2	25 percent	67,409 applicants	0 percent	0 applicants
3	20 percent	54,499 applicants	100 percent	93,383 applicants
4	20 percent	55,077 applicants	100 percent	67,409 applicants

The 2016 Driving Credentials for Resident Immigrants Study recommended an original DPC to cost \$51. Based on population estimates at the time, this fee would cover DMV's costs within the first year of implementation, as well as a one-time start-up payment of \$50,000 to the Department of Taxation for a real-time electronic verification system.

Finally, the *Code of Virginia* currently specifies that the minimum fee for a license renewal is \$20. As a result, the Driving Credentials for Resident Immigrants Study recommended that an original DPC cost \$51, while a renewal would cost \$20. However, these fee amounts will no longer result in a revenue neutral impact. This is due in part to

the decreased population estimate. With fewer individuals estimated to purchase the credential, each credential fee has to cover a larger portion of the fixed costs. Additionally, changes to two cost estimates have increased expenditures. First, the two percent July 1, 2019, raise for state employees increased DMV's expected staffing costs. Second, DMV's credential vendor increased the cost per card by \$0.02 from their previous estimates. This increase results in higher ongoing expenditures.

SB 1641 includes a \$90 fee for an original DPC, and a \$40 fee for a renewal. As a result, DMV will experience a revenue increase of approximately \$8.4 million in the first year of implementation. In later years, the credential fees would generate between \$5.4 million and \$8.6 million in revenue annually for DMV, if everyone who is eligible for a DPC successfully applies for one. These revenues will be sufficient to cover the additional 84 full-time staff and related expenditures necessary to implement SB 1641.

The sources of revenue consist of the original DPC at \$90 and DPC Renewals at \$40, where applicable. The revenue total also includes a two dollar re-exam fee for customers who initially do not pass the knowledge exam and return to take the test. The re-exam amount is calculated using historical failure rates.

For someone convicted of a Class 5 felony for providing false information to obtain this credential, a judge has the option of sentencing him to up to one year in jail, or one to 10 years in prison. Therefore, this proposal could result in an increase in the number of persons sentenced to jail or prison.

There is not enough information available to estimate reliably how many additional inmates in jail could result from this proposal. Ultimately, the presiding judge will decide if there is to be any time served in jail; however, any increase in jail population will increase costs to the state. The Commonwealth presently pays the localities \$4.00 a day for each misdemeanor or otherwise local responsible prisoner held in a jail and \$12.00 a day for each state responsible inmate. It also funds a considerable portion of the jails' operating costs, e.g. correctional officers. The state's share of these costs on a per prisoner, per day basis varies from locality to locality. However, according to the Compensation Board's most recent Jail Cost Report (November 2018), the estimated total state support for local jails averaged \$33.83 per inmate, per day in FY 2017.

Due to the lack of data, the Virginia Criminal Sentencing Commission has concluded, pursuant to §30-19.1:4 of the Code of Virginia, that the impact of the proposed legislation on state-responsible (prison) bed space cannot be determined. In such cases, Chapter 2 of the 2018 Special Session I Acts of Assembly requires that a minimum impact of \$50,000 be assigned to the bill.

9. Specific Agency or Political Subdivisions Affected: Department of Motor Vehicles, Department of Taxation.

10. Technical Amendment Necessary: No.

11. Other Comments: This bill is similar to HB 2025 and HB 1843.

At the time of the 2016 study, the Department of Motor Vehicles attempted to find data about the potential economic benefits of DPCs, including increased job opportunities and better paying jobs for DPC holders. However, DPCs were such a recent development that data is nonexistent concerning their economic impacts.

A few years have passed since then, and as such, the Department of Motor Vehicles found some early research into the impacts of DPCs. In April 2017, the National Academy of Sciences published an article stating that the issuance of DPCs increases highway safety. In particular, the researchers found that issuing DPCs decreased the number of hit and run accidents in California. The full article can be found at <https://www.pnas.org/content/114/16/4111>.

In addition, issuing DPCs may have an impact on judicial efficiency. Judges often see the same drivers without licenses multiple times in court. Since the driver does not have a license, variations in recording the driver's name or the driver simply providing a different name for each offense may result in the judge treating each incident as if the driver is a first-time offender, which impedes the judge's ability to apply the stricter penalties usually assigned to repeat offenders.

Date: 1/16/2019

Document: G:\18-20\FIS 2019\SB1641.docx

Cc: Secretary of Transportation